

**CITY OF ST. LOUIS
CULTURAL RESOURCES OFFICE
PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES
JULY 22, 2013**

Board Members Present

Richard Callow, Chairman

Alderman Craig Schmid

Anthony Robinson

Dave Visintainer

Cultural Resources Office Staff Present

Betsy H. Bradley, Director

Bob Bettis, Preservation Planner

Jan Cameron, Preservation Administrator

Andrea Gagen, Preservation Planner

Adona Buford, Administrative Assistant

Roll called. Board member David Visintainer moved to approve the June 24, 2013 minutes and the current Agenda. Alderman Craig Schmid seconded the motion. The two motions passed.

PRELIMINARY REVIEWS

A. 2013.1185 1309-13 DOLMAN LAFAYETTE SQ. HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Anthony Seaborn

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct two-story single-family dwelling on vacant parcels.

PROCEEDINGS: Board members, Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, and David Visintainer were present for this testimony.

Anthony Seaborn and Katherine McGrath, the applicants, were not present for this meeting.

Cultural Resources Office Director Betsy H. Bradley made a presentation that examined the section of City Ordinance

#69112, which sets forth the standards for new residential construction in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. Ms. Bradley recommended the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval as the project will meet the Lafayette Square Historic District Standards. A PowerPoint presentation was used to illustrate the site and site plans.

Keith Houghton, representing the Lafayette Square Development Committee, supported the proposed construction.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 1311-15 Dolman, is located in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District on a block of Dolman where significant demolition has taken place;
- the applicant has proposed a Historic Model Example for the new house, 1020 Dolman, that has been approved by the Cultural Resources Office;
- although the applicant does not yet have plans for the new construction, he has studied the standards and has committed to meeting them in a document submitted to the Cultural Resources Office;
- the applicant proposes to construct a dwelling with a façade that is the mirror image of the façade of the example, and to replicate its entrance, fenestration pattern, recessed entrance bay, and cornice design;
- the applicant proposes four sides of the house to be brick; the foundation to be scored concrete; and agrees to meet the materials and design requirements for the entry and windows;
- the siting of the house would be in alignment with the historic four-family to the north; its north side yard would be a similar width as that from the adjacent building and a townhouse to the north of it; the property would have a wider side yard on the south; and
- the finished project would include a fence and garage to be built behind the house.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the proposed new construction, with the condition that the design be developed as proposed and that design details be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office to ensure compliance with the Lafayette Square Historic District Standards. The motion was made by

Alderman Craig Schmid and seconded by Mr. Visintainer. The motion passed with two Board Members voting in favor of the motion and none opposing it.

B. 2013.1157 1421 MISSOURI AVENUE LAFAYETTE SQ. HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Charles and Patricia Hoffman

RESIDENTIAL PLAN: Preliminary review to construct a two-story alley house on a vacant parcel.

PROCEEDINGS: Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, and David Visintainer were present for this testimony.

Cultural Resources Office Administrator Jan Cameron made a presentation that examined the section of City Ordinance #69112, which sets forth the standards for new residential construction in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District. Ms. Cameron recommended the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval as the project meets the Lafayette Square Historic District Standards. A PowerPoint presentation was used to illustrate the site and site plans.

Keith Houghton, representing the Lafayette Square Development Committee, supported the proposed construction.

FINDINGS OF FACT: The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 1421 Missouri, is located in the Lafayette Square Local Historic District;
- the siting of the proposed alley house appropriately matches historic examples of alley houses within the district;
- the applicants have proposed 1228 S 18th Street (rear) as a Historic Model Example for the new house, which has been confirmed by the Cultural Resources Office as an appropriate Model Example;
- the applicants requested that the Preservation Board allow them to deviate from the selected HME with an additional bay of windows on the front elevation. The windows will be detailed in the same way as other openings;
- the owners requested to be allowed to construct a one-story, shed-roofed porch across the front façade. As the building is located at the alley, this will provide the owners' only covered outdoor living space; and

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JULY 22, 2013

Page 4 of 10

- while there would be two deviations from the HME, the siting, details, materials and feeling of the HME are replicated; and the slope of the property down to the alley, in addition to existing landscaping at the front of the property, will obscure most views of the new building.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the proposed new construction, with the condition that the design be developed as proposed and that design details be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office to ensure compliance with the Lafayette Square Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Board member David Visintainer and seconded by Alderman Schmid. The motion passed with two Board Members voting in favor of the motion and none opposing it.

C. 2013.1156 2112 S. 11TH ST.

SOULARD HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: Chad Vancil

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review to construct a single-family dwelling.

PROCEEDINGS:

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, David Visintainer and Anthony Robinson were present for this testimony.

Cultural Resources Office Preservation Planner Andrea Gagen made a presentation that examined the section of City Ordinance #62382, which sets forth the standards for new residential construction in the Soulard Neighborhood Local Historic District.

Ms. Gagen recommended the Preservation Board grant preliminary approval for the proposed new construction with the stipulation that the setback and foundation materials are brought into compliance with the Soulard Local Historic District Standards, and that final plans and design details will be approved by the Cultural Resources Office for compliance with the district standards. A PowerPoint presentation was used to illustrate the site and site plans.

John Odom, architect for the project testified in support of the proposed new construction.

Chad Vancil, owner and applicant, was present but did not testify on behalf of the project.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JULY 22, 2013

Page 5 of 10

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 2112 S. 11th Street, is located in the Soulard Neighborhood Local Historic District on a nearly intact block;
- that although the applicant has not proposed a single Model Example for the new house, the proposed new construction draws substantially from the neighboring buildings;
- the applicant proposes to construct a dwelling where the mass, scale and proportions, ratio of solid-to-void, façade materials and garages all comply with the Soulard Historic District standards;
- the applicant agrees to move the proposed new construction to the building line of the other buildings on that block;
- the applicant will correct any discrepancies with window and door details; and
- that although the pre-cast concrete proposed for the foundation is not an approved material under the standards, it will be integrated into the construction and will provide an appropriate finish for the foundation.

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to grant preliminary approval of the proposed new construction, with the stipulation the setback be brought into compliance with the Soulard Historic District standards and that design details will be reviewed and approved by the Cultural Resources Office to ensure compliance with the Soulard Historic District Standards. The motion was made by Board member Anthony Robinson and seconded by Mr. Visintainer. The motion passed with three Board Members voting in favor of the motion and none opposing it.

D. 2013.1186 4104-56 DETONTY AVENUE SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner/Applicant: UIC, Brent Crittenden

RESIDENTIAL PLAN:

Preliminary review to construct sixteen 1½ story houses on 14 vacant lots.

PROCEEDINGS:

Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, David Visintainer and Anthony Robinson were present

for this testimony.

Cultural Resources Office Administrator Jan Cameron made a presentation that examined the Shaw Historic District Ordinance #59400, which sets forth the standards for new residential construction in the Shaw Local Historic District. A PowerPoint presentation was used to illustrate the site and site plans. Ms. Cameron recommended the Preservation Board deny preliminary approval to the current proposal as the proposed new construction does not meet the Shaw Historic District Standards.

Brent Crittenden explained the project he proposes with a PowerPoint presentation.

Sean Spencer, Executive Director of the Shaw Neighborhood Association spoke in support of the project.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Preservation Board found that:

- the proposed site for construction, 4104-56 DeTonty, is located in the Shaw Local Historic District;
- while the 14-parcel site is currently vacant, the remainder of DeTonty has a consistent and intact streetscape;
- the proposed new construction does not replicate the siting and arrangement of buildings in the historic district: all other properties on DeTonty face the street and conform to a consistent setback. The proposed plan is arranged perpendicular to the street along interior courtyards; and while courtyard arrangements do exist in a few instances in the Shaw district and neighborhood, this plan does not replicate the arrangement, parcel size and details of such courtyard developments;
- the proposed new construction will encroach a substantial distance upon the street's established building line, and four houses will extend a minimum of 10 feet in front of adjacent historic properties, although their detached garages will not;
- the proposed exterior materials are not characteristic of the building materials in the Shaw Historic District;
- the design of the houses is not compatible with historic buildings in the District in scale, mass, proportion, architectural details or exterior materials; and

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JULY 22, 2013

Page 7 of 10

- the use of forms, details, and materials that ground the buildings in the character of the Shaw Historic District *could* make the proposed plan for the development acceptable, as the project would not seem divorced from its context, as it is as currently proposed.

BOARD ACTION: Deferred. The Preservation Board decided to table the review per the suggestion of the Chairman Richard Callow and agreement of the applicant.

NEW APPLICATION

E. 2013.1141 5331 ENRIGHT AVENUE VISITATION PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

Owner: Solofts c/o Helix Realty

Applicant: Bellon Salvage and Rehabbing

DEMOLITION PLAN: Demolition permit application to demolish a three-story brick dwelling

PROCEEDINGS: Board members Richard Callow (Chairman), Alderman Craig Schmid, David Visintainer and Anthony Robinson were present for this testimony.

Cultural Resources Office Director Betsy H. Bradley reviewed the criteria for demolition in the Visitation Park Certified Local Historic District Use, Construction and Restoration Standards in City of St. Louis City Ordinance #56942 and for a property located in a Preservation Review District, using the standards for demolition as set forth in St. Louis City Ordinances #64689 and #54832.

Ms. Bradley recommended that the Preservation Board deny approval of the demolition application unless a compelling argument is presented for the impracticability of rehabilitation as subsequent construction would follow. She stated key points from emails received from Paul Hohmann, Bill Seibert, Andrew Weil, and Karen Bode Baxter, all of whom wrote in opposition to demolition, and entered the communications into the record.

Michael Allen and Bill Siebert testified in opposition to the demolition.

Amy Levin, one of the property owners, described the circumstances under which the property was acquired and

presented estimated costs for rehabilitation and information on recent sales of single-family homes in the vicinity.

Ms. Levine also provided a letter from a structural engineer that described the condition of the property and a letter from Alderman Frank Williamson in support of the demolition. She stated that it was not economically feasible for her to rehabilitate the property.

FINDINGS OF FACT:

The Preservation Board found that:

- there is no Redevelopment Plan adopted by ordinance that includes this property.
- 5331 Enright is a Merit property, a contributing property in the Visitation Park Certified Local Historic District and is in a Preservation Review District.
- the Visitation Park Historic District standards state that structural unsoundness and extreme deterioration are the reasons to support approval of demolition;
- the residence has the appearance of being sound, in terms of the definition of the ordinance;
- some recent projects have been completed in the neighborhood where residential rentals dominate.
- the reuse potential of this large house would be single-family residential unless the zoning is changed and must be considered in terms of the likelihood of its being a rental property, and a multi-family unit;
- 5331 Enright has a role in urban design as the one historic dwelling on the north side of Enright, yet it stands in a blockface that does not have the typical density, integrity, and rhythm of a blockfront in a historic district;
- the owner is proposing new construction, a four-family rental building on the site of 5331 Enright; and
- the commonly-controlled property and accessory structure criteria are not applicable for this application;

BOARD ACTION:

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to deny a demolition permit because the applicant's proposal did not meet the conditions for approval of a demolition permit. The motion was made by Alderman Craig Schmid and seconded by

Mr. Visintainer. The motion passed with three Board Members voting for the motion.

SPECIAL AGENDA ITEMS

Nominations to the National Register of Historic Places

F. National Cash Register Company Sales and Repair Building – 1101 Olive Street

ACTION: Andrew Weil made a presentation about the building. Bob Bettis recommended that the Board endorse the nomination.

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the National Cash Register Company Sales and Repair Building meets the requirements of the National Register Criterion A. The motion was made by Board member David Visintainer and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.

G. Downtown YMCA Building – 1528 Locust Street

ACTION: Michael R. Allen made a presentation about the building. Frank Ward, Chief Financial Officer of the Young Men's Christian Association of Great St. Louis made some comments, noted that when contacted in the past he had expressed reservations about listing the building in the National Register and was unaware of the nomination moving forward until receiving notification from the City of St. Louis that the property would be considered this evening. He stated concerns about being able to make interior changes and acknowledged gaining some understanding of what listing in the National Register would mean at the meeting. Betsy Bradley noted that the Preservation Board's recommendation was advisory to the State Advisory Board.

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that the YMCA Building meets the requirements of the National Register Criterion C for Architecture. The motion was made by Board member David Visintainer and seconded by Mr. Robinson. The motion passed unanimously.

H. Dorris Row - 1105-09 Olive Street

ACTION: Michael R. Allen made a presentation about the building and property owner Craig Heller requested the support of the nomination. Betsy Bradley recommended that the Board not make a recommendation on this property due to concerns with its historic integrity.

PRESERVATION BOARD MINUTES

JULY 22, 2013

Page 10 of 10

It was the decision of the Preservation Board to direct staff to prepare a report for the Missouri State Historic Preservation Office that Dorris Row meets the requirements of the National Register Criterion A. The motion was made by Board member David Visintainer and seconded by Alderman Craig Schmid. Mr. Anthony Robinson opposed the motion. The motion passed 2 to 1.

Chairman Richard Callow moved to adjourn the meeting. Hearing no objection, the meeting was adjourned.